Animal Welfare Audits on Dairy Operations
Jim Reynolds DVM, MPVM
Veterinary Medicine Teaching and Research Center
Tulare, CA

Goals for this meeting:
• “Set the stage”
• Present some of the areas of concern in farm animal welfare using dairy as model
• Describe the current dairy welfare assessment and audit programs
• Take a walk through the NCCR/FMI audit

Animal Husbandry = Animal Welfare
• Cattle must be taken care of properly to be comfortable and to produce economically
• Consumers of livestock products expect us to treat the animals humanely
• Farm animal care and welfare programs will only make life better for the animals, the workers and the owners
• Animals must always be treated with compassion, dignity and respect

Why have, or talk about, on-farm welfare audits?
US Consumption of Veal and Beef (USDA)

- **Beef Consumption**
  - 1950: 1200
  - 1960: 1204
  - 1970: 204
  - 1980: 3000
  - 1990: 2500
  - 2000: 2000
  - 2002: 3000

- **Veal Consumption**
  - 1950: 0
  - 1960: 0
  - 1970: 0
  - 1980: 0
  - 1990: 0
  - 2000: 0
  - 2002: 0

**Bovine Animal Welfare**

Some issues in the US Industry:

- Colostrum
  - (bull calves)
- Calf housing
- Tail docking
- Dehorning
- Branding
- Slaughter
- Euthanasia
- Downer animals

**Farm Animal Welfare in the US**

- The Animal Agriculture Industry in the US is not uniform
- Facilities and management varies between region and within regions
- Difficult to make common standards

**Farm Animal Welfare in the US**

- Animal Welfare is dependant on the **owner’s values and attitudes**
- Not related to the size of the dairy or farm

**Assessment of Animal Welfare**

Approaches that assess:

1) Physical attributes (e.g., physiology, production)
2) Feelings (beyond behavior to cognition)
3) The natural environment (whether the animals live in the natural conditions where they started).

From AVMA Animal Welfare Forum Swine Housing – Fall 2004

**Farm Animal Welfare in the US**

- Issues such as livestock welfare have traditionally been areas for **industry self regulation**
- Rather than government regulation
Dairy Quality Assurance Center

Evaluation and Audit Process

• 3-stage evaluation, assessment, audit system
• 1) Dairy Self-Evaluation
  – Self Audit using booklet
  – “10 point plan”

Dairy Cattle Welfare Programs in the USA

“Certified Humane Raised & Handled”
  • Humane Farm Animal Care (HFAC)
  • Labeling and certification program
  • Independent nonprofit organization
  • Animal Care Standards, on-farm inspections, annual re-inspections
  • www.certifiedhumane.com

Current Dairy Cattle Welfare Guidelines and audit systems in the USA

• There are several different Dairy Cattle Welfare Guidelines and Audit Systems in place and being developed in the US
• All are *marketing driven*
• Attempt to stay competitive in marketing of products
• Being adopted by Industry in response to animal welfare activism

Current Dairy Cattle Welfare Guidelines and Audit Programs in the US

• National program from the National Council of Chain Restaurants (NCCR) and the Food Marketing Institute (FMI) / SES, Inc.
• Other private programs
  – Validus (EMS), FACTA
• State / University programs

Farm Animal Welfare Assessment

Assessment:
  • 3rd party evaluation of a farm
  • Evaluates the different areas of welfare on the farm
  • Discuss the strengths and weaknesses
  • Producer interaction
  • Educational opportunity

Some areas assessed:
  • Nutrition
    – Body Condition Scores
    – Bunk management
  • Hygiene
    – Hygiene scores
  • Lameness
    – Locomotion scores
  • Replacements
  • Medical procedures
  • Training programs
  • Euthanasia program

Farm Animal Welfare Audits

Audit:
  • 3rd party inspection of the operation
  • Conformance/ non-conformance to written policies
  • No producer interaction during the audit
Dairy Quality Assurance Center Evaluation Process

• Check off list covering diverse management areas on dairy
  – Score of more than 80% will grant 5-Star Dairy Quality Assurance
  – Evaluation will be conducted annually
• 2) 2nd party assessment using the check-off list
• 3) 3rd Party Verification/ Audit
• www.DQACenter.org

Validus, LLC

• Provides an assessment or an audit to the farm regarding animal care and welfare
• Assessment provides report to owner detailing strengths and weaknesses on farm
• Audit covers all areas of cow comfort and welfare
  (Formerly Environmental Management Solutions, EMS)
  • http://www.emsllc.org/default.asp

EMS, LLC

• AWARE program
  Animal Welfare Assurance Review and Evaluation
• Program Goals
  • Promote good animal welfare practices
  • Improve public perception of animal care in the livestock industry
  • Encourage industry-led self-awareness
• Environmental, Food safety and Biosecurity audits also available

EMS, LLC

Production practices assessed during the visits are grouped into ten areas:
• General Animal Management,
• Feed & Water Access and Quality, Herd Health, Facilities, Housing, Parlor Behavior, Special Needs Management, Handling & Transportation, Replacement Cattle, and Management. All animals on the farm will be observed. Detailed animal observations include:

Farm Animal Care Training and Auditing

Mission:
• FACTA, LLC will provide independent, professional, science-based animal care training and auditing services based on individual farm benchmarking by credentialed auditors and educators.

• Has audited humanely raised veal farms
• http://www.factallc.com/

The California Dairy Quality Assurance Program

CA Dairy QAP

Major Goals:
• Marketing Tool/ Expand Market Size
• Preempt State/ Federal Rule Making
CA Dairy QAP
The California Dairy Quality Assurance Program

- Program is voluntary.
- Industry manages the program.
- Standards are science-based.
- Certification/Documentation is required.
- Processors are allowed to use trade-marked materials as marketing tools.

NCCR/FMI Animal Welfare Guidelines and Animal Welfare Audit Program (AWAP)

- Initiated after PETA successfully pressured McDonald’s, Burger King and Wendy’s to require suppliers of meat and eggs to conform to certain welfare guidelines
  - Meat: Will only purchase beef from abattoirs that do not accept downer cows
  - Eggs: Suppliers must provide minimum space for layer hens

NCCR and FMI Animal Welfare Audit Program (AWAP)

- DQA (Milk and Dairy Beef Quality Assurance Center, Inc.)
- FMI (Food Marketing Institute)
- NCCR (National Council of Chain Restaurants)
- Veterinarians
- Dairy Producers

FOR MORE INFO...
www.DQACenter.org

NCCR and FMI Animal Welfare Audit Program (AWAP)

- This is not a pass / fail system
- Information from each dairy audit goes into database
- NCCR / FMI members purchasing milk will decide which questions are important
- May sort database to select dairies to fit consumers
- Dairy identification hidden and protected
- Audits managed by SES, Inc.

Does the facility train its employees in the following tasks?

Animal movement (flight zones, animal behavior, transportation).

Yes No N/A

2005 Penn State Dairy Cattle Nutrition Workshop 51
### Does the facility train its employees in the following tasks?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Handling non-ambulatory animals.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Does the facility train its employees in the following tasks?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Euthanizing Adult Cows (cannot be “N/A”).</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Euthanizing calves (cannot be “N/A”)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Does the facility train its employees in the following tasks?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Administering injections.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dehorning.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Does the facility train its employees in the following tasks?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training Programs and Record Keeping Are animals inspected periodically (at least weekly) for signs of distress, improper care or injury?</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training Programs and Record Keeping Are travel lanes, chutes, fences and gates inspected for damage at least weekly?</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Open Lots, Pastures and Corrals</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Is the lot, pasture or corral free of poorly drained areas that can allow cows to become excessively muddy?</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Open Lots, Pastures and Corrals

Do all animals have access to shade in hot weather?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0

Shelter in adverse weather?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0

Animal Housing and Facilities

Do floors in animal living areas have non-slip surfaces?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0

Do ≤ 3% of moving animals slip or fall?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0

Animal Housing and Facilities

Count 50 animals or 10 percent of the milking herd whichever is MORE. Make a mark for each animal that slips or falls in the box below

Animal Housing and Facilities

If there are any animals with locomotion score > 3.0, are they receiving medical treatment?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0

Animal Housing and Facilities

Is the calving conducted in a dry and clean area?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0

Animal Housing and Facilities

Do ≤ 10% of the animals exhibit “animal condition” scores < 2?
Yes  No  N/A
0  0  0
Animal Housing and Facilities

Is the animal drinking water clean (e.g., free of animal waste)?
Do primary watering areas provide at least one space / 10 animals?

Yes ☐ No ☐ N/A ☐

Role of PAACO

- Training of auditors
- Examine & Certify Auditors
- Maintain documentation of continuing education
- Certify Audits

Why is Certification Needed?

- Auditors need the following characteristics:
  - Trained as a professional in their discipline
  - Independence (credibility with customers)
  - Science-based (scientifically-sound auditable points)
  - Qualified by education & experience for each species
  - Trained by professional animal scientists & veterinarians
  - Certified education, experience and training (audit process & minimum standards)
  - Audit firms could be certified as having qualified auditors and appropriate audit procedures
  - Other on-farm auditing

Professional Animal Auditor Certification Organization

Founding Organizations
- AASV (American Association of Swine Veterinarians)
- AABP (American Association of Bovine Practitioners)
- FASS (Federation of Animal Science Societies)
- ARPAS (American Registry of Professional Animal Scientists)
- Now includes AAAP (American Association of Avian Pathologists)
Bottom-line

- On-farm auditing is a reality
  - Science-based
  - Qualified
  - Trained
  - Certified
- The Goal is verifying Animal Welfare

Summary of Dairy Cattle Welfare in the US

- *Industry* driven approach to on-farm animal welfare rather than *government* rules
- National Council of Chain Restaurants/ Food Marketing Institute adopted *guidelines*, *assessment plans* and *audit systems* to *assure consumers farm animals are cared for properly*
- Dairy Quality Assurance 5-Star program is an *assessment*, *verification* and *audit program*
- Validus is an assessment and audit program
- FACTA provides farm welfare audits

Conclusions:

**Animal Husbandry = Animal Welfare**

- Clean, dry and comfortable housing
- Balanced nutrition – cows and calves
- Trained employees
- Pain control
- Euthanasia programs
- Verification of all the above
- Retailers want real audited programs

Welfare Friendly Products

- CA Dairy QAP
- Freedom Foods
- ASPCA Monitored
- American Humane Association Monitored

Beef Consumption: 1950s to 2002

Veal Consumption: 2048 to 2005

Penn State Dairy Cattle Nutrition Workshop 2005